National Register Advanced I

October 6, 2015
1:30 – 2:45 PM
The Components of Historic Context

National Register Advanced I
Patrick Andrus
Historic Context and the National Register of Historic Places

The Gilbert H. Hamilton House
Columbus, Ohio
The Gilbert H. Hamilton House, Columbus, Ohio
Hamilton House, detail of brickwork
Is it Individually Eligible?

• What is the context for this type of building?

• Historic Theme – Tudor Revival style

• Time Frame – Early 20th century

• Geographic Area – the City of Columbus, OH
How does it compare to other examples of its style?

- What else is out there in Columbus?
- Historic Districts?
- Individual listings?
The Iuka Ravine Historic District

2090 Summit Street

2047 Iuka
The Iuka Ravine Historic District

2101 Iuka

2098 Iuka
2000 Indianola, Iuka Historic District
Frederick A. Miller House
2065 Barton Place

Front

Rear
The Malcom Jeffrey House

Front

Rear and Servants’ Quarters
The Franz Huntington House, 81 Drexel Street
Upper Arlington Historic District

Coventry St. at Chatfield St.  1685 Andover Road
Upper Arlington Historic District

2321 Yorkshire Road

1995 Tweksbury Road
So where does this leave us with the Hamilton House?
Factors to Consider

• The Historic Context for Tudor Revival Style buildings in Columbus, Ohio, is extremely rich.

• There are historic districts with hundreds of contributing Tudor Revival style buildings.

• There are sophisticated, massive examples of Tudor Revival buildings individually listed.
How Does the Hamilton House Fit Into Its Historic Context?

• Its Location
• The Quality of its construction
Historic Context and the National Register of Historic Places

Prepared by: Patrick Andrus, Historian, National Register of Historic Places, September 2015
Evaluating Significance of Additions and Accretions

National Register Advanced I

Patrick Andrus
Evaluating the Significance of Modern Additions

National Park Service
U.S. Department of the Interior
National Register of Historic Places
When do modern additions contribute to the historical significance of a property?
“The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved.” Standard 2

“Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development...shall not be undertaken.” Standard 3

“Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained.” Standard 4

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation
“New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.” Standard 9

“New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.” Standard 10

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation
Factors to Consider:

- Date and physical character of the addition
- Property’s period of significance
- Qualifying NR Criteria
- Effect addition has on the property’s integrity
Questions to Consider:

- Is the modern addition compatible with the historic building, including earlier additions?
- Does the addition have significance in its own right?
- Does it have exceptional importance?
- Is the property significant for continuing historical associations or its physical evolution over time?
- What impact does the addition have on the integrity of the original building?
What impact does the addition have on the integrity of the original building?

- Do exterior views remain visible, especially from the main entrances, principal elevations, and public right of way?
- Are most important character-defining features intact, visible, and unimpaired?
- Is addition compatible in size, scale, and character?
- How much loss of historic material, workmanship, and design has occurred to the exterior and interior due to the new addition and other alterations?
- Does the original property continue to convey its historic identity?
Bethesda Theater
Montgomery County, MD
The Bethesda Theater
Fidelity Union Life Insurance Tower
Dallas, TX

Continuing historical associations under Criterion A and exceptional architectural character under Criterion C

Wyatt C. Hedrick, arch.
Fidelity Union Building, Dallas, TX
Texas Company Building
Houston, TX

Warren & Wetmore, arch., 1914 & 1936
Kenneth Franzheim, arch., 1958-1960

“Building illustrates the oil company’s profound impact on the city’s commerce and new wealth ... and the company and the city’s sustained growth through the 1950s.”

Boundary Amendment, January 2008
Des Moines Art Center
Polk County, IA

Eliel Saarinen, arch., 1948

I.M. Pei, arch., 1968

Richard Meier, arch., 1985
1971
MARCEL BREUER
and HAMILTON F. SMITH
Architects
Cleveland Trust Company Building
Cuyahoga County, OH

- “Rotunda Building” 1908
- George B. Post & Sons, arch.
- Francis Davis Millet, muralist
The Cleveland Trust Company Bld.
Tower Addition
Marcel Breuer, 1971

- Little loss of historic fabric
- Exceptional local example of master architect’s work and recognized late 20th century style
Alfred Schiller House
Du Page County, IL
Paul Schweikher, arch., 1954
Significance in the “pairing” of design by two modernists.
Colorado National Bank Building
Denver, CO

1915
Rooftop Addition in New Formalism style, 1964
In Summary

- Is the modern addition compatible with the historic building, including earlier additions?
- What impact does the addition have on the integrity of the original building?
- Does the addition have significance in its own right?
- Does it have exceptional importance if less than 50 years of age?
- Is the property significant for continuing historical associations or its physical evolution over time?
The Hearst Tower, New York City

1928 building

2006 addition

EXPERIENCE YOUR AMERICA
Evaluating the Significance of Modern Additions

Presented by: Patrick Andrus, Historian

National Register of Historic Places

2015
Farms, Factories, and Futuristic – Evaluating Significance

National Register Advanced I
Patrick Andrus and Barbara Powers
Farmsteads

• Look Beyond the Farmhouse
• Context of the Farm within Areas of Agricultural Production
• Compare/Contrast Farm within type, period, layout of farms in area
• Understand construction techniques/changes in technology
Ault-Weygandt Farm
Orrville, vic., Wayne County

Local Level of Significance
Criteria A, C
c. 1827-1951
Agriculture
Architecture
NR listed -- 2002

Sweitzer Barn, c. 1827

Weygandt Farmhouse, 1914
Chicago Home Wrecking Co.
Orrville Cast Stone Co.
Ault-Weygandt Farm
Wayne County, Ohio

Figure 1:
A typical courtyard plan farm, Wayne County, Ohio, 1873.
Location of house, forebay, barn, driveway, and fields nearly identical to
Ault-Weygandt Farm.
Ault-Weygandt Farm
Wayne County, Ohio

Sketch Map 1950

Sketch Map 2000

county road 23
Industrial Properties

- How does the property fit into the industrial history locally or at state level
- Understand industrial and manufacturing processes associated with the factory complex
- Understand building technology and industrial construction
N. J. Rich and Co. Building
Cleveland, Cuyahoga County

Local Level of Significance
Criteria A, C
1911-1952
Industry
Engineering
Education
NR listed -- 2003

Wilbur J. Watson & Co., architects
The National Concrete Fireproof Co., contractors
The N. J. Rich and Co. Building
Cleveland, Cuyahoga, Ohio

Photograph of the East Wall
(Image reversed. The Cleveland News, 31 July 1934. Cleveland Public Library Collection.)
Recent Past/Less Than Fifty Years Old

- NR Criteria has not changed!
- Scholarship must exist to provide a historic perspective
- May have to look to a broader context/sources to establish significance
- < 50 years old properties must demonstrate *exceptional importance* within its context and in comparison to other similar properties
Riverview  
Toledo, Lucas County  

Local Level of Significance  
Criteria A, C  
1969-1977  

Architecture  
Community Planning/Development  
Landscape Architecture  

Commerce  
NR listed -- 2012  

Fiberglas Tower, Harrison and Abramovitz, architects  

Levis Square
Historic Photo, 1969-70
Tower East
Shaker Heights, Cuyahoga County

State Level of Significance
Criterion C
Criterion Consideration G
1967-1968
Architecture
NR listed -- 2014

Tower East, Walter Gropius (with The Architects Collaborative), architect
Turner Construction Co., builder
Figure 8: Corner Treatment Studies, 1966
The Walter Grunebaum Archive, Volume Four
National Register Advanced II

October 6, 2015
3:00 – 4:15 PM
Historic Districts

National Register Advanced II
Patrick Andrus
Putting It All Together – National Register Case Studies

National Register Advanced II
Huron School (McCormick School)
Huron, Erie County

Local Level of Significance
Criterion C
1943-1952
Architecture
NR listed -- 2011

Harold Parker & C. Edward Wolfe, architects; R. C. Reese, structural engineer; Jurgens Company, builders
Fairview Public School and Annex
Cincinnati, Hamilton County

Local Level of Significance
Criterion A, C
1888-1958
Education
Architecture
NR listed -- 2010

1888-1890, H. E. Siter, architect
1957-1958, Edward J. Schulte, architect
George Washington Carver Addition
Historic District, Columbus, Franklin County
National Level of Significance
Criterion A
1943-1963
Community Planning/Development
Ethnic Heritage/Black
NR listed -- 2013
Criterion B

Properties associated with the lives of persons significant in our past
A. B. Graham House
Columbus, Franklin County

State Level of Significance
Criterion B
1938-1960
Education
Social History
NR listed -- 2015
Templin-Bradley Company
Cleveland, Cuyahoga County

Local Level of Significance
Criterion A
1916-1956
Agriculture
Commerce
Other (City Beautiful Movement/Progressive Era)
NR listed -- 2013
A scan of a select page from the 24-page 1922 Templin-Bradley seed catalog included in the W. Atlee Burpee & Company Collection at the Archives of American Gardens.

To You for Your Garden:

Let us stop for a few moments and talk together, some of the reasons why this catalog can help to make your garden most satisfying this year.

An Unusual Catalog For nineteen years we have stuck to our policy of sending only the very best seeds to our customers. This accounts for the unusual size of this catalog. As proof that the time is right, we point to the really wonderful demand for our seeds, more than $1,000,000 packets being sold last season. So you will find here only the varieties for which there is the greatest general demand from all classes of gardeners.

A Convenient Catalog We believe that ordering from this catalog is a very easy matter, because everything is listed alphabetically in each department. You will find the numbering system too, so by using it, you need not take to write the names of the varieties you wish to plant. To give you a good idea of what the different types of flowers and vegetables look like, we have used an unusually large number of illustrations.

Unusual Service We are able to render unusual service to our customers for two reasons. First, because of the more than thirty years which Mr. Templin has devoted to the seed and nursery business. This gives us a knowledge of the best qualities of seed, as well as a lifetime understanding of what the public demands from a nurseryman. Second, for the development of our strong organization, trained to things right, plus the exceptional facilities which are big buildings and first-class equipment.

Gardening Handbook! We have prepared this 64-page greenhouse, "Better Garden." It is the latest that we can offer you. We have compiled the necessary details on growing the soil, planting, mulching, watering, spraying, and storing. Also includes some planting arrangements for bedding, roses, shrubs, and vines. This handbook is full of facts and figures, and is priced at $1.00 or more. We believe it to be a necessary addition to any gardener's library.

Note: We are not responsible for any loss which you may sustain from your seeds. In case of damaged or delayed shipping, we will send you replacement seeds at no extra cost. If you place an order for any seed which we do not have in stock, we will notify you within six weeks.

Order Early! Don't wait until planting time. Don't wait until late in the season to order. Don't wait until you have all your supplies ready. Remember, your garden is the most important investment you can make. The success of your garden is in your hands. The Templin-Bradley Company is devoted to making your garden a success.

Two Big Reasons Why You Should Order from Us This Year

1. We guarantee your satisfaction on the return of any seed, at any time, for any reason, under our present or past policies. In either case, you are fully satisfied.

2. We guarantee your satisfaction on the purchase of any plant, at any time, for any reason, under our present or past policies. In either case, you are fully satisfied.
Hercules Motor Corporation Industrial Complex
Canton, Stark County

Local Level of Significance
Criteria A
1855-1955
Engineering
Industry
Transportation
NR listed -- 2005